
Penderfyniad ar yr Apêl

Ymweliad â safle a wnaed ar 09/01/18

gan Siân Worden BA MCD DipLH
MRTPI

Arolygydd a benodir gan Weinidogion Cymru
Dyddiad: 26.01.2018

Appeal Decision

Site visit made on 09/01/18

by Siân Worden BA MCD DipLH MRTPI

an Inspector appointed by the Welsh Ministers
Date: 26.01.2018

Appeal Ref: APP/H6955/D/17/3191706

Site address: Ty Carreg, Vicarage Road, Brymbo, Wrexham LL11 5LF

The Welsh Ministers have transferred the authority to decide this appeal to me as the appointed Inspector.

- The appeal is made under section 78 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 against a refusal to grant planning permission.
 - The appeal is made by Mrs Katie Williams against the decision of Wrexham County Borough Council.
 - The application Ref BRY P/2017/0833, dated 6 October 2017, was refused by notice dated 9 November 2017.
 - The development proposed is the demolition of the existing conservatory and construction of a single storey rear extension and internal alterations.
-

Decision

1. The appeal is dismissed.

Main Issue

2. I consider that the main issue in this case is the effect of the proposed development on the character and appearance of the existing dwelling and surrounding area.

Reasons

3. The appeal property is a detached house. It is located at the end of a row of dwellings of various styles on the outskirts of Brymbo and in a rural setting. The proposal is to demolish the existing conservatory and replace it with a single storey extension.
 4. The existing dwelling comprises two wings set at right angles to one another; at ground floor level the existing lounge occupies most of the slightly larger wing. The extension is proposed adjacent to the lounge with a footprint of similar dimensions to it. It would therefore project significantly into the garden, extend across perhaps two thirds of the dwelling's frontage, and its mono-pitch roof would rise to just below the first floor windows. Unlike the existing conservatory, which is a modest addition, the proposed extension would over-dominate the main house, masking its pleasing proportions and detracting from its attractive, cottage-like appearance. The slight encroachment of the extension onto the forward-facing, gabled elevation would also be a jarring detail. Overall, the proposed development would be out-of-scale, unbalanced and obtrusive.
-

5. The single plane roof and large, glazed, folding doors on two sides would give the proposed extension a modern appearance. As its quite simple form and construction materials would be in keeping with the existing dwelling, however, I do not consider that the contemporary design would be incongruous. The lower floor level of the proposed extension would not be clearly apparent externally and not, therefore, detrimental. In itself, the design would not harm the appearance of the existing building.
6. Ty Carreg is on a corner plot at a junction and at a slightly higher level than the surrounding roads. Despite the wall with wooden fence on top which bounds the property, and the mature tree opposite, the proposed extension would be clearly visible to passers-by from several points on Vicarage Road. From Glyn Lane views of the dwelling are largely blocked by the playhouse.
7. I have found, therefore, that the scale of the proposed extension would not accord with the character of the site or make a positive contribution to the appearance of the nearby locality. It would thus be contrary to Policy GDP1 of the Wrexham Unitary Development Plan 1996-2011 (UDP), adopted 2005. In detrimentally affecting the surrounding countryside the proposed development would also be inconsistent with UDP Policy PS2.
8. I am aware that an extension of the size proposed is required to meet the needs of a growing family. The benefit of the proposed development in meeting those needs does not, however, outweigh the harm caused to the dwelling and surrounding area. My role is to determine the scheme before me on its merits and not whether it might be permitted development. Nonetheless, and although it does not contain the main entrance, my view is that by reason of its extent, outward-facing orientation, architectural detail and fenestration, the side of the dwelling on which the conservatory is currently located is the principal elevation.

Conclusion

9. By reason of its disproportionate size the proposed extension would harm the character and appearance of the existing dwelling and, consequently, that of the surrounding area. I have taken all the matters raised into consideration but not found any compelling reasons to allow the appeal.
10. In reaching my decision, I have taken into account the requirements of sections 3 and 5 of the Well Being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015. I consider that this decision is in accordance with the Act's sustainable development principle through its contribution towards the Welsh Ministers' well-being objective of supporting safe, cohesive and resilient communities.
11. For the reasons given above I conclude that the appeal should be dismissed.

Síân Worden

Inspector